

REVIEW REPORT BY MAITLAMO PROJECT SECRETARIAT TEAM

DRAFT NATIONAL ICT POLICY

Comments and Changes suggested to the National ICT Policy:

This note may please be read along with the draft of the policy marked with comments; the file names of the marked files have the phrase 'Revised - NOV IRMK26110 added to the last part of the file name. The markings are colour coded with all comments on Statistics highlighted in green, deadlines and targets highlighted in yellow and general suggestions highlighted in blue.

These comments must also be considered in association with the minutes of steering committee held on 16th November 2004 and the task force meetings held just prior to these meetings.

1. The writing style, font, chapter, paragraph numbering and referencing system could same as done for the Legislative Framework and Change report. *(after incorporating the changes suggested to be made on it)*
 - The tone and language must be very tactful and not inflammatory, for example, in the 4th paragraph of chapter 3 of the Policy it is stated that “11% of the population never attending school..” we could instead say “ 89 % of the population are attending school”
 - The Botswana culture express the most distressing situation in a positive manner; such a tone and language may be adopted as far as possible. This was communicated in the email communications after the 12th July review with taskforce chairpersons and the in the October 2004 review report.
2. Firm references must be quoted for all statistics quoted very tactfully stating why international data was taken. Where ever available CSO or MFDP NDP 9 data or Education policy data or data from MOH documents or data of an official report of a ministry/organization could be quoted. For example, all the data in chapter 1 may be same as the introduction in NDP9. This may be verified and stated to be taken from NDP 9. The data- figures and statistics in all Maitlamo documents must be consistent with each other and with the same date of units and definitions with the date and source of the data stated clearly. *For example in chapter 3, fourth paragraph (un numbered) of ICT policy quotes 11% of children never go to school which is same as 3.5 of Legislative Framework, but chapter 2 of appendix C of the policy action plan states that there is universal access to education with 95% enrolment at primary and junior level with 50% at secondary and 5% at tertiary. Similarly the cell phones are quoted in ICT Policy chapter 3, 1st paragraph as 530,000 versus 404000 land phones, this is the same in the Legislative Framework (date/year not*

given). But in chapter 2 Appendix F, it state that 132,000 have land phone (March 2004) and 556000 mobile phones (March 2004). In both cases, the source is not given. We would need firm reference with the source and date of the data used/quoted anywhere in any report. As far as possible we may link to CSO other Government ministries data where ever available. Such seemingly minor disparity is giving a wrong signal to the readers about the thoroughness and accuracy of the study.

3. The entire document presumes very little ICT usage outside the government. *The ICT sector survey has now been redone and we know that the government sector is about P400 million per year and the non government sector could be as high as P800 million to one billion per year. Most of this IT spending goes directly abroad.* We need to look into ways how this could remain within the country. Taskforce Advisor for Economic Empowerment has been telling us this about many industries especially tourism. We may apply his arguments and suggestions on keeping more of this turnover within the country for ICT in all sectors of the economy. *Thus all implications of the findings of the revised ICT sector survey need to be taken care of, by having policy in place to win (not reserve) as much of this for the ICT players within Botswana.*
4. It is felt that the in education system, the ICT Curriculum should meet the specific requirements of ICT industry. This principle should apply to the ICT courses run within Botswana and to all the ICT courses abroad to which the Government of Botswana sponsors deserving citizen candidates.
5. It is felt that the policy address the establishment of ICT/Technology park to promote Research in ICT and Research centres of multinational corporations to be located in Botswana. *Such parks need not necessarily be funded and paid for by the government but the policy should encourage Private sector (Or joint private-public) local and foreign investment; the policy may put in place measures that will encourage such ventures.*
6. The local content with cultural diversity (*not just local languages*) needs to be emphasised to drive people to use the PCs and demystify ICT.
7. Present draft gives a perception that funding for implementation of Maitlamo would come from the government alone; there is a need to explore and analyse innovative funding options for the projects to run with investors funds with the cost recovered by diverting a percentage of the fees charged and revenue generated as a result of the an ICT enabled service or E Government service given to the public. Policy should address how the project can generate its own funds e.g. for e-Government, services, (e.g. Immigration, vehicle licensing, revenue collection -- except those critical in security point of view), can be outsourced with the condition that the supplier of the service owns and runs the service for a long term contract period and does all the investment for the same, the services are paid for on a per transaction basis and this amount recovered from the fees charged by the Government for that service. In the

case of free services the contribution of the government could be looked at as a grant or sponsorship paid on a per transaction basis. We believe there are several successful models of such outsourcing e.g. Immigration control in the US, Revenue and customs duty collection by South Africa (SARS). ***We would like to concentrate on such best practices for emulation by us. We are confident that from the vast array of best practices given in the Benchmarking and best practice report we will be able to concentrate on such best practices that earn as they run.***

8. We acknowledge the effort taken in developing the governance structure suggested in the Policy, however it has the following primary problems:
 - It assumes that ICT is the government effort not national issue (***Will not promote National ownership***)
 - It proposes that MCST totally give up ICT endeavours and pass it to Office of the President, this move is not practical.

Under the guidance of National ICT Policy Steering committee chairperson, the Maitlamo secretariat has proposed and presented the structure shown IN ***APPENDIX 1***. The governance section in chapter 5 may be recast according to this structure.

9. All targets should be realistic taking care of points raised in taskforces and steering committee meetings.
10. The possibility of ***linkage to the principles of WSIS needs to be examined***. Compatibility with the SADAC guidelines -- see A 2.2 of the contract page 7 Of 21 second bullet under the subsection 'Technological Standards'
“Lay down some recommendations to align the policy with those standards in the SADAC region and the rest of the world”
11. Terms should be used carefully such as HLCC. The word inland revenue should be replaced by MFDP or Botswana Unified Revenue Services. Copyrighted names, document extracts, photographs, maps etc, such ***School Net or the Map of Botswana from Encyclopaedia Britannica © 2001 and any thing that may make us liable to breaking the international copy right acts*** should not be used anywhere in the document. (***We need to show a strong respect for copy right and anti piracy international laws and agreements***). The document should also list some of the words that are used and that Botswana need to register for copyright such as Maitlamo. The word citizen should be used carefully as the right and responsibility of citizens are defined and privileges differ across citizens, residents and expatriates.
12. Complete writing should be as suggested in 1 above, however we need to put summary policy statements that can be used for cabinet memorandum. These principles should be in the form of “Therefore the ICT Policy of Government of Botswana shall be ...”

This should be statements of policy principles; --- Principles that will apply for a long time --- in concise, formatted and numbered in the traditional manner and without targets.

13. Citizen Owned Business in Information Technology (COBIT) is a very important stakeholder. They have kind enough to give the following feedback on the ICT Policy:

- We as COBIT had a concern that the study has not endeavored to adequately to cover or extrapolate how much capacity exists locally and how much will be needed to implement the projects in Maitlamo
- How we are to ensure that local companies(especially citizen companies)capacity is to be grown to ensure meaningful participation and long-term sustainability
- Opportunities for public private partnerships to ensure that government alone does not bear the cost of implanting Maitlamo especially since government has adopted the principle of PPPs
- The policy does not also address the issue of incubators and innovation funds which would ensure local innovation and R&D so that solutions can be produced locally and even exported to the region facilitating us becoming a regional ICT hub
- How much information is online already and its state and accessibility, how are all the different ministry websites are going to interact with each other and the proposed government e-portal, and how standards are to be met and what is to be done about .gov websites that do not meet minimum standards e.g. Ministry of finance, ministry of trade, which are going to hamper the key objectives of information and services being made available online
- The policy does not address government users as a big online community in terms of what information and services especially employees services should be provided to them through intranets. This is especially important as the more information and services are available online for government users e.g. pension information; leave days etc the more likely they will be receptive to providing the community and public online information and services, a key objective of this exercise.
- The use of intranets with-in government will also greatly help achieve and effective flow of information in government, greater cooperation and more efficient service delivery e.g. if ministry accounts officers could check online the status of a payment for a supplier they would be able to give them prompt service.

- What is the state of e-readiness of government employees in order for them to effectively help drive Maitlamo as they are very key to its success.
- How is Maitlamo going to affect current initiatives and international protocols that we have endorsed e.g. the WSIS protocol and how are they going to be consolidated and reconciled?

Also the following points raised by COBIT in 17th August had been communicated to you and we are confident that they have been taken care of:

- There should be an effort to qualify the local IT industry both citizens Companies foreign but locally based companies capacity and benchmark this against other countries that have succeeded goals in building themselves robust local IT industries and are ICT hubs.
- We should also benchmark key factors, such as local capacity, trained citizens professionals needed if we are to compete in Markets such as BPO and call centres .This should be done against countries that are successful in these areas.
- We should also identify and benchmark how countries successful in key identified areas e.g. tourism, agriculture has utilised technology to boost these sectors and the approach.
- An attempt should be made to identify which skills we are importing, viz- a-viz which skills are available locally.
- We should include key industry sectors such as banking as they play a crucial role in investment and tourism promotion.
- Local initiative currently underway should also be looked at to see if they may be adopted or improved upon.

It is requested that:

- a) these reviews be taken care of***
- b) we get analysis of all the points of the 17th August as to what the team of experts fill about these points and how far these can be taken on board.***

APPENDIX 1 : PROPOSED MAITLAMO GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE

